

wenngleich er sich überwiegend eben mit der Neuzeit beschäftigt. Ein Register der Tiere und Fabelwesen schließt diesen begrüßenswerten Sammelband ab.

Albrecht Classen

Hugo O. Bizzarri and Martin Rhode, Tradition des proverbes et des exempla dans l'Occident médiéval / Die Tradition der Sprichwörter und exempla im Mittelalter. Colloque fribourgeois 2007 / Freiburger Colloquium 2007 (Crinium Friburgense, 24), Walter de Gruyter, Berlin and New York, 2009, pp. 336.

One might assume that proverbs are simply the stuff of the folklore, and exempla confined to preaching manuals intended for instructing the folk. This well-formulated collection of essays, however, proves otherwise, positing an important coexistence and intersection of proverbs and exempla. Indeed, Hugo Bizzarri's introduction lays the ground for understanding the general theme of the colloquium and, by extension, of the collection: the points of contact between the proverb and the exemplum. Moreover, the fourteen essays here exhibit a surprising range of approaches, fields, languages, and time periods.

Several essays center on the (changing) definition of proverb/exempla. For example, Klaus Grubmüller's essay calls for a broadening of the definition of the exemplum, suggesting both that exempla can be comic and, conversely, that short tales and fabliaux can have a didactic and moralizing function. Grubmüller's essay neatly follows in the vein of Hugo

Bizzarri's introductory essay, which outlines the difficulty of defining the proverb and the exemplum, alluding to the overlap in definition between the two in such works as the dialogue of *Solomon and Marcolf* and Juan Manuel's *Conde Lucanor*. For Bizzarri, there is a back-and-forth movement between the two terms, particularly in dialogue, exemplary biographies, and fables, rather than in sermons, where they remain distinctly defined entities. Carlos Alvar's essay on Galician/Portuguese chansons carefully demonstrates the difficulty of generic definition, since although *refrán* ('traditional saying,' itself derived from *fabla*, *fabliella*, and sometimes simply called *verbo antiguo*, or *verso*, or *viessa*) was traditionally distinguished from *proverbio* by its popular origins, *refrán* acquires the notion of proverb or proverbial saying in the fifteenth century. From this *point de départ*, Alvar cogently examines the re-use of such 'traditional sayings' in court poetry, and finds that proverbs and proverbial sayings fill the chansons, especially satirical song, of Galician and Portuguese poets.

A few essays look to the *artes praedicandi* and the use of proverbs and exempla by preachers in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Marie Anne Polo de Beaulieu and Jacques Berlioz argue that proverbs inserted in collections of exempla function as a means of creating 'cultural' connections and collusion between preachers and the laity. Their study focuses on texts in which proverbs were used freely: first, in four thirteenth-century collections, including the works of the Dominicans Etienne de Bourbon and Humbert de Romans, the Franciscan

Tabula exemplorum, and the Dominican *Compilacio singularis exemplorum*; second, in two fourteenth-century texts, Jean Bromyard's *Summa praedicatorum* and the Old French *Ci nous dit*; and finally, in exemplary literature, particularly that of Jacques de Vitry. They quite perceptively see Latin collections attesting to the oral use of proverbs: while written in Latin, they were meant to be spoken in the vernacular, as the expression 'vulgariter dicitur' reveals. They find that while Cistercians and Franciscans rarely used proverbs, Dominicans typically made use of proverbs slightly more often, and moreover, that proverbs appear more frequently in vernacular collections of exempla. They conclude therefore that preachers did have collections of proverbs at their disposal, some of which were written for use in preaching. These scholars also provide a useful appendix of eight proverbs that appear in the *Compilacio singularis exemplorum*. Franco Morenzoni, on the other hand, pinpoints mid-thirteenth century Parisian preachers whose sermons most frequently use proverbs. Morenzoni notes that the *Artes praedicatorum* and the *Distinctiones* often employ proverbs both as a means to introduce a prayer or a sermon and as a means to divide the thematic material; and moreover, such preachers as Nicolas de Biard or Guillaume d'Auvergne made use of proverbs as explanatory or exemplary material in their collections of sermons. Audrey Sulpice analyzes the function of proverbs in the fourteenth-century *Tombe de Chartreuse*, a collection of thirty-one tales of salvation intended for use in predication not only to Carthusians, but

also to the laity. Sulpice persuasively demonstrates how in this collection, the proverb (or proverbial expression) serves both as a means of corroborating the veracity of the exempla in which it is inserted, or moreover, of generating the exempla that it introduces. Sulpice thus sees a 'relation de complémentarité' between exemplum and proverb, but one in which the proverb, deriving from a popular, literary language, confirms and guarantees the authorial – clerical – voice. Sulpice's essay is particularly rich: its attention to codicology and literary analysis extends to important questions of praxis, i.e., how the manuscripts were used.

Delphine Carron's essay turns the reader to larger questions of philosophy, here described as the study of how to live well. Her careful examination of Cato the Younger, the Roman statesman and philosopher, as he appears in Latin medieval proverbs, exempla, and moralizing couplets (distiches), unveils how he became in the Middle Ages an example of the life of wisdom. With a thorough examination of exemplary allusions to his life, and the widespread use of three formulaic proverbial expressions ("nomina vana Catones," "Intus Nero, fori Cato," "E tertius Cato cello cecidit"), she cogently describes how for medieval theologians and writers (including Jerome, Peter the Cantor, and John of Salisbury), Cato provided a model of austerity, humility, self-sacrifice, and devotion to civic duty. Her brief analysis of the *Disticha Catonis* reveals that Cato the Younger and Cato the Censor were in the Middle Ages frequently conflated, so that "Cato" here

has become simply a descriptor, even synonym, for a wise man.

Philippe Ménard's analysis of a collection of proverbs contained in Cambridge Corpus Christi MS 450 extends Carron's preoccupation with the medieval reception of this classical figure of philosophy to our own era. Ménard's argument turns on the problem of how to understand *mentalités médiévales*, which have for many years been understood based on the extant writings of a noble and clerical class or on the study of a collective unconscious. He enumerates several difficulties inherent to his study: first, that many proverbs are based on simple observation, and have no deeper signification; that the meaning of some proverbs is obscure; and finally, that this particular collection contains many – some 465 – proverbial expressions. His analysis nevertheless draws some valuable conclusions about the medieval mindset based on this collection: that the proverbs' disdain of peasants and women, and criticism of nobility in Corpus Christi MS 450 may indicate a clerical point of view; that descriptions of hunger and poverty indicate a knowledge of the poor, perhaps drawn from this very milieu. For Ménard, this collection, while representing an intersection of several *mentalités* (clerical and peasant), chiefly presents a cynical, pessimistic, and closed, vision of the world and of human beings, one that seems decidedly non-clerical.

Several essays treat proverbs in literary contexts, and it is here that we find the widest geographical/linguistic focus of the collection. This is most in evidence with Regula Forster's analysis of

proverbs and exempla in the Arabic work *Kalila wa-Dimna*. Forster notes that in this text both proverbs and exempla fulfill a rhetorical, even argumentative function. Forster's essay is critical, for it reminds the Eurocentric reader that proverbs and exempla are a part of the cultural exchange between East and West (or more precisely, evidence of the influence of the East on the West): after all, the Arabic *Kalila wa-Dimna* was adapted into Latin, Spanish, Greek, and Hebrew in the thirteenth century, and German in the fifteenth. Looking toward the Continent, Elisabeth Schulze-Busacker's examination of the *Proverbes au villain* (ca. 1175) provides a literary and historical contextualization of this work, particularly in terms of the three Anglo-Norman rhyming translations of the *Disticha Catonis* and the *Fables* of Marie de France. Moreover, Schulze-Busacker cogently suggests that the *Proverbes au villain* adds not only a rhymed but also a strophic quality to these collections of proverbs, and thus grants to the *Proverbes* an important rhetorical role in the development of medieval French literature. Alfonso D'Agostino, on the other hand, surveys a goldmine of examples of proverbial literature in thirteenth-century Italy. D'Agostino enumerates how proverbs occur not only in such prose works as *Fiori e vita di filosafi e d'altri savi e d'imperadori*, the *ars dictandi*, especially of Guittone d'Arezzo, and vernacular translations of the *Disticha Catonis*, but also in poetical texts, both didactic (e.g., Garzo dall'Incisa's *Proverbi, Proverbia super natura feminarum*, Girardo Patecchio da Cremona's *Splanamento di li*

Proverbii de Salamone) and lyrical (e.g., lyrics by Percivalle Doria, Bonagiunta Orbicciani, Giacomo da Lentini, Guido delle Colonne, and Chiaro Davanzati, among others). D'Agostino's essay neatly illustrates the widespread use of proverbs, or in other words, their application in broad generic contexts.

Three essays focus on Spanish literature. Bernard Darbord studies the paraphrastic function of the proverb in the fourteenth-century *Libro de los gatos* (a translation of the English cleric Eudes de Cheriton's thirteenth-century *Fabulae*) and the *Libro de Buen amor*. For the first, he demonstrates how the exempla included therein frequently conclude with a lapidary statement, a proverb or a saying. To describe the role played by proverbs in the *Libro de los Gatos*, he provides a taxonomy of characteristics of the proverb, including its opacity, stability, bipartite structure, generalizability, and linguistic and syntactic specificity (i.e., inversion, phonic repetition), and then categorizes the types of proverbs that appear in the *Fabulae* according to the behavior of the protagonist. For the second, Darbord notes that Juan Ruiz's use of *fabla*, *fazaña*, and *proverbio* unveil the extent to which his poetic practice of is founded upon paraphrase. Ultimately, he finds that the proverb, like the exemplum which it can even replace, is designed to illustrate, and thus to paraphrase, a salvific lesson. Carlos Heusch's study of the exemplum in books 1 and 2 of Jean Manuel's *El Conde Lucanor* nicely complements Darbord's essay. Heusch demonstrates that Manuel's interest in style (whether it is clear and rhetorically amplified or ob-

scure and rhetorically abbreviated), not only upsets the dictates of classical rhetoric and the framework of stylistic definitions upon which he himself has set out, but is, moreover, matched by a movement from didactic clarity (the exemplum of Book 1, drawn from the *sermo humilis*) to obscurity (the proverb of Book 2, drawn from an Eastern tradition), despite the fact that Manuel calls both exemplum and proverb by the same name, 'enxiemplo.' This movement from the clarity of the exemplum to the obscure and difficult wisdom of the proverb is, as Heusch persuasively argues, a means to structure the book as a 'chemin de sagesse' for the reader. Hugo Bizzarri's concluding essay on proverbs in Castilian incunables and early printed books (1471-1520) concludes the collection. Here Bizzarri examines the *Libro de Apolonio* and the Castilian translation of Aesop's Fables, Cato and the recreations of the *Disticha Catonis*, and Castilian collections of proverbs, among others, in order to unveil how the incunables and early printed books, while relying upon traditional expressions of the proverb contained in manuscripts sometimes to the point of archaism, nevertheless frequently invented new versions for a newly literate mercantile class. He remarks that collections of proverbs and exempla, based on their commercial successes, were not peripheral but rather primary texts in the era of printing. Bizzarri's essay is fascinating in how it explains the innovations in the genre of proverbs wrought by incunables and early printed books: for example, he notes that this was in part due to the intervention of printers, who were fre-

quently German, and who, while introducing Erasmus to Spain, brought the influence of his *Adagia* to Castilian proverbs.

The collection does not suffer from a weakness common to many collections: that of organization. While the editors could have made the thematic resonances more apparent by grouping the essays under particular rubrics (say, proverbs and exempla in predication manuals, or in literature), they have placed essays with similar themes in proximity, which allows the reader to make intertextual (whether geographical, generic, or thematic) connections between them. This is especially true in the case of the two essays (those of Darbord and Heusch) dedicated to proverbs in Spanish literature. But how much more breadth of understanding could the reader have gained by having Alvar's essay on proverbs in Galician and Portuguese songs and Bizzarri's essay on proverbs in Castilian incunabula and early printed books as bookends to these two essays? Ultimately, the small problems of organization detract little from what is a collection of provocative and well-crafted essays on a subject that deserves more scholarly attention.

*Michelle Bolduc · Department
of French, Italian, and Comparative
Literature · Curtin Hall · P.O. Box 413 ·
University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee ·
Milwaukee, WI 53201 ·
mbolduc@uwm.edu*

Albrecht Classen (ed.), *Urban Space in the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Age*, Walter de Gruyter,

Berlin and New York: 2009, viii, 757 pp. 70 illustrations.

This collection consists of an editorial introduction and twenty-three articles originally presented at the Fifth International Symposium on Medieval and Early Modern Studies at the University of Arizona in 2008. Twelve are by scholars of literature, eight by historians, and one each from art, geography, and religion. Nineteen concern mainly the fourteenth through sixteenth centuries; two are earlier and two later. They are individually footnoted without bibliographies. Quotations in languages other than English are translated.

The first 108 pages of Classen's introduction is a summary of "historical, mental, cultural, and social-economic investigations" of "urban space in the Middle Ages and the Early Modern Age" (p. 1) that can be read with profit even without reference to the other papers, which he then links by individual synopses to the main themes. C. David Benson reconstructs medieval English authors' discussions of the urban space of Rome, finding that most were concerned mainly with Rome's past and remains of the martyrs, although some were interested in ancient monuments. Continuing the theme of "Defining the Medieval City through Death," Kisha G. Tracy discusses the relocation of tombs and cemeteries outside town walls in the late Middle Ages and the importance of saints' relics and tombs in the founding myths of major cities. The presence of the dead was a force attracting living migrants to relocate to urban space. The theme of death is also present in Alan V. Murray's paper on the two ethnic

von Lavardin De querimonia, Adelards von Bath De eodem et diverso, Laurentius' von Durham Consolatio de morte amici, des Bernardus Silvestris Cosmographia und De planctu Naturae des Alanus von Lille. B. macht deutlich, wie die kurze Blütezeit dieser Gattung mit einer ganz bestimmten geistesgeschichtlichen Situation zusammenfällt: Erst im 12. Jh. war es möglich, Texte, die bis dahin als Autoritäten wahrgenommen und verinnerlicht wurden wie die Consolatio des Boethius, unvoreingenommen auf ihren Realitätsgehalt zu befragen. Fast alle unter den genannten Autoren kommen dabei zu deutlichen Zweifeln an der optimistischen Einstellung des Boethius zum Verhältnis von Vernunft und Triebhaftigkeit, zur fraglosen Überlegenheit des Geistigen über das Körperliche im Menschen. Ein Charakteristikum der Gattung ist es, daß der Konflikt letztlich jedesmal ohne Lösung bleibt. Folgerichtig war es die Akademisierung des Bildungswesens im Lauf des 12. Jh., die dieser Form des Prosimetrum ein Ende setzte. Für den spielerischen Umgang mit den großen Fragen des Daseins, der nicht auf eine konkret faßbare Lehre ausgerichtet ist, war an den Universitäten kein Platz mehr. Diese Art von literarischer Daseinsbewältigung verlagerte sich in die volkssprachigen Literaturen; den Roman de la Rose des Jean de Meun sieht B. als organische Fortsetzung der Gattungstradition. V. L.

Tradition des proverbes et des *exempla* dans l'Occident médiéval. Die Tradition der Sprichwörter und *exempla* im Mittelalter. Colloque fribourgeois 2007. Freiburger Colloquium 2007, édité par/hg. von Hugo O. BIZZARRI / Martin ROHDE (Scriinium Friburgense 24) Berlin u. a. 2009, de Gruyter, 336 S., ISBN 978-3-11-021794-0, EUR 99,95. – Wie der Hg. B. in seiner Introduction: Le passage du proverbe à l'*exemplum* et de l'*exemplum* au proverbe (S. 7–23) herausstellt, waren das Thema der Tagung, die vom Institut d'Études Médiévales der Univ. Fribourg im Oktober 2007 organisiert wurde, die Interferenzen zwischen den literarischen Gattungen von Sprichwort und Exempel, die allein schon aufgrund ihrer thematischen Nähe vielfältig aufeinander eingewirkt haben. Naturgemäß nahmen dabei die volkssprachlichen Literaturen einen großen Raum ein. Hier sollen nur die Titel angezeigt werden, die sich mit Gattungen der lateinischen Literatur auseinandersetzen. Das Thema erweist sich auf diesem Gebiet als nicht gerade ergiebig. – Marie Anne POLO DE BEAULIEU / Jacques BERLIOZ, „Car qui a le vilain, a la proie“. Les proverbes dans les recueils d'*exempla* (XIII^e–XIV^e siècle) (S. 25–65), referieren die volkssprachlichen und ins Lateinische übersetzten Sprichwörter in den bedeutendsten Exempelsammlungen. – Franco MORENZONI, Les proverbes dans la prédication du XIII^e siècle (S. 131–149), stützt sich auf zu großen Teilen unedierte Predigtlehren und -sammlungen und stellt erst nach der Mitte des Jh. und ausschließlich im Umfeld der Pariser Univ. eine Verwendung von Sprichwörtern in nennenswertem Umfang fest. Vorsichtig schlägt er vor, den sehr plastischen und volksnahen Predigtstil des Pariser Bischofs Wilhelm von Auvergne als Anreger einer solchen Modeerscheinung zu sehen. – Delphine CARRON, Présence de la figure de Caton le philosophe dans les proverbes et exemples médiévaux. Ses rapports avec les ‚Disticha Catonis‘ (S. 164–190), ist eine Stellen-sammlung mit zuweilen recht phantasievollen Übersetzungen. V. L.